The Relationship of the Organizational Justice to the Organizational Commitment and the Organizational Citizenship[1]

Belgin KORKMAZ[2], Mehmet ULUTAŞ[3]

Abstract

The aim of this study is to investigate the effect of organizational justice comprehension in schools on teachers' perceptions of organizational commitment and organizational citizenship. Meta - analysis method was used in the current research. During the review process of the research, 27 different studies contained in the scope of organizational commitment were analyzed. In the study, 6875 people related to the organizational commitment and 6316 people related to the organizational citizenship were included in the study. In relation to the findings of the research, it was seen that the perception of organizational justice had a positive and moderate effect on their organizational commitment of teachers and a positive and low effect on the perception of organizational citizenship. Suggestions, such as informing managers about organizational justice and conducting different studies on new samples with different scales, were added for the practitioners and researchers.

Keywords: Meta-Analysis; Organizational Justice; Organizational Commitment; Organizational Citizenship.

Introduction

People's penchant for justice is based on living together and working to survive and meet the social and economic needs. The concept of justice is discussed because people live together and they feel the need for fair distribution of benefits that are earned to meet their needs (Atalay, 2005:6). Employees, while working, tend to observe other employees and seek equality. An employee's perception of justice is among important factors influencing the individuals' commitment to the organization and their job satisfaction (Akyol, 2013:2). Organizational justice is a substantial conceptualization explains the importance of justice in an establishment, the ability of the organization to do business and the satisfaction of employees (Greenberg, 1987:2). The importance of education for individuals' lives and for the communities is undeniable reality. Education is a tool that contributes to communities and individual attainments. In this century, education is importantly functional for a nation's welfare levels (Kis, 2013:2) because high quality education refers to both individual and national affluence (Basaran, 1982:145). The schools are the basic systems in education, and they need a convenient environment to be effectively realized (Kis, 2013:2). Today, when continuous and fast changes are experienced, effective schools need leaders behaving justly. Studies (Dündar, 2011; Gunce, 2013; Karaman, 2009; Kardemir, 2010; Onder, 2017; Yildiz, 2010; Yildiz, 2012) reveal that the comprehension of organizational justice impacts the organizational behaviors.

1

The comprehension of organizational justice is observed to improve the citizenship behavior and as can often be found in the relevant literature, positive perception of justice leads to positive attitude and behaviors in the personnel. It prompts high levels of commitment, and the commitment substantially decreases when others exhibit different behaviors. When the employees believe they have a right to speak, they perceive everything as fair, and this impacts their commitment considerably (Cihangiroglu and Yilmaz 2010: 209). Many research on the relation of the organizational justice to the behaviors of commitment and the behaviors of citizenship have been conducted; however, what those studies altogether mean has not been examined. Those studies need to be reviewed in general and the level of effect by the organizational justice on the said behaviors needs to be studied. Therefore, it is considered that a meta-analysis study needs to be conducted.

This study seems significant in terms of investigatinge, more broadly, the effect of the comprehension of justice on behaviors and revealing the general tendency in this respect. Also, no study holistically examining the relation between the organizational justice and the organizational behaviors has been found in the relevant literature. In this context, the current study, extensively examining the relationships between the organizational justice and the organizational behaviors in teachers, is considered academically significant in contributing to synthesize research.

Organizational Justice

The organizational justice involves fair divisions of possibilities, the process of conclusion, and the interpersonal interactions. It is about being fair in both sharing the economic benefits and applying strategies and policies, in an organization (Cremer, 2005:4). Cropanzano and Wright (2003) describe the organizational justice in relation to the way punishment and rewards are distributed; how the conclusions are reached; and the rules of interpersonal practices are set. The organizational justice relates to building relationships between the employees and the administrators and developing those without discriminating among personnels. Building the said relationships depends on respecting employees' dignity, identity, rights and responsibilities, and their cultural values. The organizational justice is about the process of reviewing the decisions on the role-distribution, authorization, the distribution of rewards among the employees, the level of compensation, tracking shifts, etc. Considering those, the organizational justice can be described as the workers' comprehension of how far the administrators are in their decisions and practices. Within the context of those descriptions, the organizational justice can be defined as the personnels' positive comprehension of the administrators' decisions about the employees (Icerli, 2010:67).

A school's leadership, the leadership understanding to build the school structure, and other organizational variables are definitive in reaching goals. Therefore, the factors influencing the justice perception at schools and the way the justice impacts the teachers' perception are quite important. The more justly the decision-making administrators behave, the more just the relationships built among the teachers and between the teachers and the administrators become (Titrek, 2009:552). The teachers, students, and the administrators believing that the success is based on their own efforts, they have some control over results, their performance goes up with extra effort, the good performance is rewarded, and superiors treat them respectfully and justly put forward more effort, compared to others. When the teachers, who support their students after school, participate in extra-curricular activities, and prepare for each class hour, notice those skipping work, avoiding volunteer tasks, barely staying until the end of working hours, staying away from meetings, and evading responsibility, they will get the impression that things are unfair (Hoy and Miskel, 2015:145).

Organizational Commitment

Many definitions of the concept of commitment are available. Majority of those focus on the instrumental commitment and the commitment beyond. For instance, the organizational commitment is described as an individual's partial and influential commitment to the worths and goals of an organization. Here, the commitment is beyond an instrumental dedication in such a way that the individual works, based on the organizational values and goals, just to improve the organization. Committed employees believe in and own the organizational values and goals and they voluntarily respond to expectations and orders. Those employees, also, put forward effort far more than expected. In addition, the committed employees are intrinsically motivated (Balay, 2000:3).

The organizational commitment relates to the affection in the people toward their organization. As the commitment positively influences the organizational performance, it is found to reduce such negative behaviors as unattendance, quitting the job, etc. The organizational commitment involves the basics of organizational protection. That is because the committed employees are more adjusted, more productive, and loyal, and they work responsibly, and thus, cost the organization less (Balci, 2003:14). Committed employees believe in the organizational values and goals and are decided about staying in the organization by putting forward their best effort within those goals (Balay, 2000:3). Educators' commitment to the schools is crucial in terms of effectiveness in the schools (Ozmen, Arbak, and Ozer, 2007). Lower levels of teacher commitment negatively impact the student achievement. Teachers experiencing burnout are less tolerant of students and shortcomings in the classrooms; in general, they face exhaustion and intolerance. Those teachers put forward less effort for academic improvement and shun overcoming hardships they experience. Eventually, an agreeable situation between the teacher and the students occurs. In such a situation, teachers lower their academic expectations of students in return for a well-managed classroom with more social relationships (Balay, 2000:7).

The organizational commitment is an indicator of teachers' professional perception, satisfaction, and the degree of integration at the school they work for. At the same time, the effectiveness of education is based on many details such as the interaction among the teacher as the most significant factor in the teaching-learning procedure, the students, and the administrators. In this interaction, the administrator at the school is the principal and the manager in the classroom is the teacher. In this context, when teachers feel committed to their students, schools, colleagues, and the profession, they can contribute to the school effectiveness at higher levels (Balay, 2000:6). It is known that teachers' commitment contributes to the students' achievement and is, reciprocally, positively impacted by the student achievement. As such, it is known that lower levels of commitment lead to lower levels of the student achievement. Administrators' behaviors are among the most effective factors to improve the teachers' commitment. It can be said that the administrators that are sensitive to teachers' needs and expectations, eliciting participation in decisions, building, and preserving a culture of democracy, and building the managerial justice have an important role in ascertaining, increasing, and maintaining teacher commitment (Norsenli, 2020:55).

Employees believing that opportunities and outcomes are distributed fairly in an organization are expected to have high levels of organizational commitment. Individuals think that they must be equally offered opportunities and privileges in their organization (Bakan, 2011:194). School administrators need to have fair practices, respect opinions, and have a fair and equal attitude on many occasions. That is because, teachers' perception of justice increases based on those practices and they are motivated to put forward effort to make the school more effective with more qualities. Their happiness and satisfaction through their efforts will make them more committed to the school. Education leaders' respect towards teachers and their say will increase the perception of justice and positively impact teachers' commitment to the school. An inclusive management by the administrators and involving teachers in the management processes will increase their grades of organizational commitment. The teachers with higher grades of job satisfaction will put forward more effort to reach their teaching goals. The school administrators must treat everyone fairly and equally, stick to the rules of the education system and the school, and avoid arbitrary practices. Thus, they should positively impact teachers' perception of justice and increase their emotional and normative commitment. The desired quality in education requires higher levels of teacher commitment. The administrators, working for this, need to have attitudes and behaviors that could positively impact teachers' perception of justice. Research shows that teachers' comprehension of organizational justice influences their organizational commitment (Akyuz, 2013; Balci, 2019; Cokuk, 2013; Gunce, 2013; Onder, 2018; Oztug and Bastas; 2012; Sahin and Kavas, 2016; Selbi, 2019).

Organizational Citizenship

The organizational citizenship is described as the altruistic and voluntary behavior that supports the employees in reaching the organizational goals (Iplik, 2015:5). The organizational citizenship, considered the best method of providing organizational effectiveness, involves behaviors such as voluntarily completing tasks that are not formally included in the job classification, cooperating with

3

others, saving resources, using time properly, etc. The organizational citizenship involves three basics: going beyond the job description, performing more than expected, and rewarding those behaviors in the organization (Greenberg and Baron, 2000; as quoted in Iplik, 2015: 7). Even though the citizenship is based on voluntarism, every positive behavior in the organization is not within the organizational citizenship. A behavior to be considered within the organizational citizenship needs to be compatible with the organizational goals and approved by the leaders. It also needs to be acceptable by other employees. Citizenship behavior is split in two based on the types of participation. The first involves actively exhibiting the behavior and contributing to the organization. The second type involves avoiding behaviors that could hurt the organization. Although those two differ, they basically are about serving the organization (Ozdevecioglu, 2003: 118- 119).

Compared to the other organizations, schools are considered the fittest organizations for exhibiting the citizenship behaviors as they basically aim to educate people. Positively involving job satisfaction, the organizational justice, motivation, the organizational commitment, cooperation, etc. at schools will contribute to improve citizenship behaviors. The positive attitudes by the teachers, at the functional center of education processes, build expectations in them of the schools. Therefore, the school administration must direct the teachers towards the organizational citizenship behaviors. For quality and effective education, not only the teachers but also the administrators, students, the staff, and the parents must prioritize citizenship behaviors because in a school organization, each individual influences the others. Everyone at the school needs to belong to the school and act accordingly. Thus, the teaching and education will progress in a healthy manner. A perception of injustice and insecurity may prevail in individuals that do not consider themselves a citizen of the school. Individuals with negative attitudes will cease to act in implement with the school goals and targets and this will lead to unfavorable outcomes. In order to prevent this, some effort must be put to make the teachers feel belonged in the school. High levels of effectiveness and efficiency in teachers, at the center of the process, increase the quality of educational activities. High efficiency in teachers requires attitudes and behaviors that support teachers' positive organizational perceptions such as the organizational justice etc. That is because the comprehension of organizational justice is a significant factor influencing the teachers' organizational citizenship behaviors. In addition, it's worth discussing about what behaviors the perception of justice promotes in teachers.

Considering the organizational outcomes that the teachers' belief in fair management leads to, it may be argued that this belief will bring important consequences in terms of the effectiveness of education. The teachers believing in fair management are inevitable to exhibit more citizenship behaviors for the improvement of the schools. In conclusion, it may be said that the comprehension of organizational justice has a definitive impact on teachers' citizenship behaviors. Therefore, for the teachers to exhibit citizenship behaviors, the administrators need to prioritize justice. Those school administrators focusing on the feelings of justice will be more successful than others in increasing teacher performance. Studies show a consensus on a positive mid or low-level relationship between the organizational justice and the organizational citizenship behavior (Akguney, 2014; Akyuz, 2012, Caglayan, 2014; Gunes, 2019; Kilic, 2014; Moorman, 1991; Yildiz, 2012). It can be said that the teachers' perception of fair management will increase their tendency to exhibit citizenship behaviors.

This study aims to investigate the effect of teachers' perception of justice on their organizational commitment and organizational citizenship. Based on the aim of this study, the sub-questions are formed as follows:

1. What is the size and direction of the effect of organizational justice in the relationship between organizational justice and organizational commitment, and what is its level? Are school level, the type of publication, the sample area, the field of study and the sample size variables the mediating variables in the effect of organizational justice on teachers' organizational commitment?

2. What is the size and the direction of the effect of organizational justice in the relationship between organizational justice and organizational citizenship, and what is its level? Are school level, the type of publication, the sample area, the field of study and the sample size

4

mediating variables in the effect of organizational justice on teachers' organizational citizenship?

Methods

In the related research, the meta-analysis method, which is based on the combinations of researches, was used to investigate the effect of organizational justice comprehension by teachers on their commitment to the organization and organizational citizenship behaviors. The paucity of studies in the field and the scientists' need to synthesize research led to the emergence of this method (Cogaltay, Karadag & Oztekin, 2014: 485). Meta-analysis, which synthesizes the findings of independent research carried out at distinct times, in distinct places and under different conditions, achieves the most accurate quantitative results. While reaching these results, correlational studies are used (Cumming, 2012: 6).

The Population and the Sample

Current research population is formed research on the relationship between the organizational citizenship and the organizational commitment. 57 studies were reached. The research sample consists of 27 studies, based on the criteria (correlational values) to be included in this research, out of the 57.

Inclusion Criteria

Criteria of inclusion, for the research, in the meta - analysis in this study are as follows:

- To be conducted before 01.01.2021,

- To have a sample of teachers,

- To include the required statistical data (correlational values),

- To have a sample group within Turkey,

- For the articles included in this research, to be published in peer-reviewed journals.

Exclusion Criteria

Criteria of exclusion, for the research, in the meta - analysis in this study are as follows:

- to lack the required quantitative data (correlational data),

- to have an identical data set.

Analysis of Mediators

It is among the purposes of this research to investigate whether the level of school, the type of publication, sample area, the field of study, and the sample size are mediating variables in the effect of the organizational justice on the commitment and the citizenship behaviors. The mediator (mediating variable) effect was found through Q test in this study. Mediating variables are independent variables that affect the results and that were used in the meta-analysis for finding out the level of this effect. In this research, the mediating effect of the variables of level of school (pre-school, elementary, secondary education, special education), publication type (master's thesis, doctoral dissertation, article), sample area (Aegean, Black Sea, Central Anatolia, Eastern Anatolia, Marmara, Mediterranean, Southeastern Anatolia, and the 7 Regions), field of study (education, business, defense sciences, sports sciences, and undefined), and sample size(1-100, 101-200, 201-300, 301-400, 401-500, 501-600, 601-700,701-800, 801- 900, 901-1000, 1000+) were examined.

Data Analysis

This research is based on the correlational data analysis as a meta - analysis method. Excel, Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) 26, and Comprehensive Meta Analysis V3 software's were used in this study.

5

Assumptions

It was assumed that the included studies in this research:

1.   have been conducted in accordance with the scientific research conventions,

2.   had findings reported objectively.

Limitations

This study has some limitations. Therefore, the findings obtained in this study should be interpreted considering those limitations. The limitations in this study are:

1.   Meta-analysis research requires reaching all studies published and unpublished. However, only published studies could be included in the analysis in this research.

2.   This research is limited to the studies meeting the criteria for comprising in the analysis.

Findings

Findings associated with the Organizational Justice and the Organizational Commitment

Table 1 presents the meta-analysis results based on the relationship between the teachers' organizational justice perception and their organizational commitment. The effect size of the organizational justice on teachers' organizational commitment was found as r=0.508. The findings showed a *positive* and *mid-level* effect of the organizational justice on the organizational commitment.

6

Table 1.
The Effect Size and Mediator Analysis Results of the Organizational Justice and the Commitment

Variable	k	n	r	CI (Confidence Interval)		Q	p	Q_b
				Lower Limit	Upper Limit			
Commitment	17	6875	0.508	0.412	0.603	250.511	0.000	
Mediator (School Level)							0.178	**6.298**
Pre-School	1	125	0.367	0.189	0.544			
Elementary	7	3.695	0.421	0.291	0.550			
Secondary education	4	1.485	0.628	0.444	0.813			
Special Education	1	300	0.413	0.299	0.527			
Mixed	4	1.280	0.613	0.327	0.899			
Mediator (Publication Type)							0.229	**2.945**
Article	4	1.482	0.709	0.405	1,012			
Master's Thesis	11	4.045	0.439	0.329	0,508			
Doctoral Dissertation	2	1.348	0.525	0.340	0,709			
Mediator (Region)							0.046	**12.798**
7 Regions	1	679	0.437	0.038	0.512			
Mediterranean	2	1.224	0.444	0.029	0.500			
Eastern Anatolia	1	206	0.331	0.193	0.468			
Aegean	2	422	1.064	0.631	1.496			
Southeastern A.	3	1.231	0.490	0.298	0.682			
Central Anatolia	2	300	0.257	-0.046	0.559			
Marmara	6	2.813	0.493	0.367	0.620			

Mediator analyses results showed that, in the effect of the organizational justice on teachers' commitment, the school levels (Q_b= 6.298, p>.05), the type of publication (Q_b= 2.945, *p*>.05), and the field of study (Q_b= 0.454, *p*>.05) were not statistically significant and did not have mediating roles.

On the other hand, the region where the research was conducted (*Qb*= 12.798, *p*< .05) and the sample size (Q_b= 71.679, *p*<.05) were found to be statistically significant and they were mediators in the effect of the organizational justice on teachers' organizational commitment. Based on the region where the research was conducted, a *low-level* effect in the Central Anatolia [*r*= 0.257]and the Eastern Anatolia [*r*= 0.331] regions, a *mid-level* effect in the 7 Regions [*r*= 0.437], the Mediterranean [*r*= 0.444], and the Southeast Anatolia [*r*= 0.490] regions, and a *high-level* effect in the Aegean region [*r*= 1.060] was found.

Based on the sample size mediator, the organizational justice was found to have a *very high-level* effect on teachers' organizational commitment in the samples with 0.100 interval [*r*= 1.193]; a *low-level* effect in the samples with 101-200 interval [*r*= 0.36]; a *mid-level* effect in the samples with 201-300 interval [*r*=0.412], 301-400 interval [*r*=0.568], 401-500 interval [*r*=0.424], 601-700 interval [*r*=0.404], and 901-1000 interval [*r*=0.434].

7

Findings associated with the Organizational Justice and the Organizational Citizenship

Table 2 presents the meta-analysis results based on the relationship between the teachers' organizational justice perception and their organizational citizenship. The effect size of the organizational justice on teachers' organizational citizenship was calculated as r=0.338. The findings showed a *positive* and *low-level* effect of the organizational justice on the organizational citizenship.

Table 2.
The Effect Size and Mediator Analysis Results of the Organizational Justice and the Citizenship

Variable	k	n	r	CI (Confidence Interval)		Q	p	Q_b
				Lower Limit	Upper Limit			
Citizenship	10	6316	0.338	0.231	0.445	163.255	0.000	
Mediator (School Level)							0.001	**13.474**
Elementary	4	2.352	0.215	0.61	0.369			
Secondary education	3	2.038	0.491	0.446	0.537			
Mixed	3	1.926	0.360	0.218	0.502			
Mediator (Type of Publication)							0.001	**13.191**
Article	2	1.162	0.472	0.415	0.530			
Master's Thesis	5	3.073	0.224	0.103	0.346			
Doctoral Dissertation	3	2.081	0.442	0.345	0.540			
Mediator (Region)							0.005	**16.693**
7 Regions	1	1281	0.461	0.406	0.516			
Mediterranean	1	357	0.448	0.344	0.552			
Eastern Anatolia	1	400	0.331	0.232	0.429			
Aegean	2	1.289	0.135	-0.076	0.345			
Central Anatolia	1	805	0.483	0.414	0.553			
Marmara	4	2.061	0.345	0.211	0.478			
Mediator (Field)							0.424	**0.640**
Education	8	5.516	0.330	0.199	0.461			
Business	2	800	0.411	0.262	0.561			
Mediator (Sample Size)							0.000	**139.929**
301-400	3	1.157	0.436	0.320	0.551			
401-500	2	856	0.315	0.176	0.453			
501-600	1	534	0.210	0.186	0.295			
701-800	1	721	0.263	0.190	0.336			
801-900	1	805	0.483	0.414	0.553			
901-1000	1	962	0.030	-0.033	0.093			
1000+	1	1.281	0.461	0.406	0.516			

Mediator analyses results showed that, in the effect of the organizational justice on teachers' citizenship behaviors, the school levels (Q_b= 13.474, $p<.05$), the type of publication (Q_b=13.191, $p<.05$), the sample region (Qb= 16.693, $p<.05$), and the sample size (Q_b= 139.939, $p<.05$) were statistically significant and had mediating roles. The field of study (Q_b: 0.640, $p>.05$), on the other hand, was not statistically important and did not have a mediating role.

Based on the school level mediator, the effect of organizational justice on teachers' citizenship behaviors was found as *low-level* in the studies conducted in elementary level[r=0.215] and mixed-school level[r=0.3609] studies, and *mid-level* in the studies conducted in secondary school [r=0.462]. Based on the publication type mediator, a *mid-level* effect was found in the articles [r=0.462] and the doctoral dissertations [r=0.442] and a *low-level* effect in the master's theses [r=0.224].

Based on the sample region mediator, the organizational justice was found to have an *insignificant-level* effect on teachers' organizational citizenship in Aegean region [r=0.135], a *low-level* effect in the Eastern Anatolia [r=0.331] and Marmara [r=0.483] regions, and a *mid-level* effect in the 7 Regions [r=0.461], Mediterranean [0.448], and the Central Anatolia [r=0.483].Based on the sample size mediator, an *insignificant-level* effect in the sample with 901-1000 interval [r=0.030], a *low-level* effect in the samples with 401-500 interval [r=0.315], 501-600 interval [r=0.210], 701-800 interval [r=0.263], a *mid-level* effect in the samples with 301-400 interval [r=0.436], 801-900 interval [r=0.483], and 1000+ interval [r=0.461] was found.

Discussion, Conclusion, and Recommendations

This section includes the basic research findings and, in addition, the recommendations for further studies for practitioners and researchers.

Conclusion and Discussion on Findings based on the Organizational Justice and Organizational Commitment

The meta-analysis results show that teachers' perception of organizational justice had a *mid-level* and *positive* (r=0.508) effect on their commitment to the organization. This research finding is like the findings of other studies (Akyuz, 2013; Ay, 2013; Buluc & Gunes, 2014; Demir, 2016; Gok, 2014; Gunce, 2013; Lacinoglu, 2010, Onder & Ates 2017; Ozgan 2011; Selvitopu, 2011; Ugurlu, 2009). In addition, this finding is compatible with the findings in the relevant literature (Norsenli, 2020; Balay, 2014; Demir, 2016). Teachers' commitment to the school and their jobs can be said to increase as their perceptions of organizational justice increase.

Mediator analyses show that the school level, the type of publication, and the field of study do not have any mediating effects. No supporting studies were found in the relevant literature in terms of publication type and the field of study. This may be due to the scarcity of synthesis studies on findings in the field of education leadership. However, in Onder & Ates' (2019) meta-analysis study, school level was found to mediate, and the effect was higher-level in the secondary education level than in elementary. Therefore, the finding about the school level, not being a mediator, has not been supported. That could be explained through the time lapse after the study and the addition of some other studies on that research.

The research region and the sample size were found to mediate. Based on the region mediator, a low-level effect was found in the studies conducted in Mediterranean, Eastern Anatolia, Marmara, Central Anatolia, and the 7 Regions; a very high-level effect was found in the studies conducted in Aegean region. Based on the sample size mediator, a high-level effect was found in the study with 0-100 interval; a mid-level effect was found in the studies with 101-200, 201-300, 301-400, 401-500, 501-600, 601-700, 701-800, 801-900, 901-1000 intervals. Studies supporting and not supporting the findings were not reached; however, considering the research region mediator, it can be said that studies conducted in the Aegean region have considerable differences.

9

Conclusion and Discussion on Findings based on the Organizational Justice and the Organizational Citizenship

The meta-analysis results show that teachers' perception of organizational justice had a *low-level* and *positive* (r=0.38) effect on their perception of organizational citizenship. This research finding is like the findings of other studies (Akguney, 2014; Caglayan, 2014; Lacinoglu, 2010; Tan, 2017). Organ and Moorman (1993) consider the organizational citizenship behaviors as the outcomes of fair management. Based on the results of this study, teachers with a perception to consider the school administration fair exhibit more organizational citizenship behavior (Blakely, Andrews & Moorman, 2005; Iplik, 2009).

Mediator analyses show that the field of study does not have any mediating effects. The school level, the type of publication, sample region, and the sample size have mediating effects. On the school level mediator, a low-level effect was found in studies conducted in elementary education level and in mixed school levels; a mid-level effect was found in studies conducted in secondary education. In Polat & Celep's (2008) research, a high-level relationship was found between the organizational justice and the organizational citizenship. That could be explained through the time lapse after the study and the addition of some other studies in that analysis.

Based on the type of publication mediator, a low-level effect in master's theses and doctoral dissertations and a mid-level effect in the articles was found. The higher level of effect in the articles can be explained through more anonymous and objective review processes for articles than those for the theses and dissertations. An objective review process in the peer-reviewed journals can be added on that also. However, no study explaining or supporting this has been found in the relevant literature (Belenkuyu, 2015: 36-37).

Based on the sample region mediator, an insignificant-level effect in studies conducted in Aegean region, a low-level effect in the studies conducted in Eastern Anatolia and Marmara regions, a mid-level effect in the studies conducted in Mediterranean, Central Anatolia, and the 7 Regions was found. Based on the sample size mediator, an insignificant-level effect in the study with 901-1000 interval, a low-level effect in the studies with 401-500, 501-600, and 701-800 intervals, and a mid-level effect in the studies conducted with 301-500, 801-900, 1000+ intervals was found. No research supporting or not supporting the findings of this study was reached. However, in general, larger effect sizes can be found in larger sample sizes.

Recommendations

Some recommendations based on the findings of analyses in this research are included below.

For Practitioners

1. School administrators' behaviors in relation to the organizational justice may ignite serious issues and eventually lead to organizational conflicts. To minimize the possible conflicts, the school administrators need to prioritize fair behaviors.

2. The administrators need to be informed about the perception of organizational justice. For this purpose, professional development sessions and mentorship applications can be made available for the administrators.

For Researchers

1. More studies on the organizational justice become available each year. With additional new research data, this research further may be replicated, and comparisons and contrasts may be drawn.

2. It was seen that scales used in the research do not vary. Researchers may reach different scales or create new scales.

10

3.   A meta - analysis study can be conducted on the relationship between the organizational justice and other organizational behaviors that were not considered in the current study. Similarly, to synthesize the other research in our field, meta-analysis studies can be conducted.

4.   It was noted that other studies on the issues examined in this research are found mostly on Marmara, respectively, Aegean, and Mediterranean regions. Studies to examine the teachers' perception of organizational justice can be conducted on other regions.

5.   The overall correlation value, with the data based on sub-dimensions in the scales, in some studies have not been provided. Researchers may include more detailed data in their studies.

References

Akguney, E. (2014). *Öğretmenlerin örgütsel adalet algılamalar ile örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışları arasındaki ilişki [The relationship between teachers' perceptions of organizational justice and organizational citizenship behaviors].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi, [M.Sc. Thesis] Marmara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, İstanbul.

Akyol, B. (2013). *Üniversitelerdeki örgütsel adalet olgusunun öğretim elemanları algılarına göre yönetim süreçleri açısından değerlendirilmesi [Evaluation of the phenomenon of organizational justice in universities in terms of management processes according to the perceptions of faculty members].* Doktora tezi [Ph.D. thesis]. Çanakkale.

Akyuz, A. A. (2013). *Örgütsel adalet algısının örgütsel bağlılık ve iş performansı üzerindeki etkisi: öğretmenler üzerine ampirik bir çalışma [The effect of organizational justice perception on organizational commitment and job performance: an empirical study on teachers].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Gebze İleri teknoloji Enstitüsü, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Gebze.

Akyuz, B. (2012). *Hizmetkar liderlik davranışlarının örgütsel adalet, örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışları ve performans üzerine etkisi: eğitim sektörü üzerine bir araştırma [The effect of servant leadership behaviors on organizational justice, organizational citizenship behaviors and performance: A research on the education sector].* Doktora Tezi [Ph.D. Thesis], Gebze Yüksek Teknoloji Enstitüsü, Gebze.

Atalay, İ. (2005). *Örgütsel vatandaşlık ve örgütsel adalet [Organizational citizenship and organizational justice].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Afyon Kocatepe Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Afyonkarahisar.

Bakan, D. (2011). *Örgütsel stratejilerin temeli örgütsel bağlılık kavram, kuram, sebep ve sonuçlar [The basis of organizational strategies, organizational commitment, concept, theory, cause and effect],* Ankara: Gazi Kitabevi.

Balay, R. (2000). *Yönetici ve öğretmenlerde örgütsel bağlılık* [Organizational commitment in administrators and teachers], Ankara: Nobel Yayın Dağıtım.

Balci, A. (2014). *Örgütsel gelişme kuram ve uygulama* (Dördüncü Baskı) [Organizational development theory and practice (Fourth Edition)], Ankara: Pegem Akademi.

Balci, İ. (2019). *Mesleki ve Teknik Anadolu liselerinde görev yapan öğretmenlerin örgütsel adalet ve örgütsel bağlılık seviyelerinin incelenmesi [Investigation of organizational justice and organizational commitment levels of teachers working in vocational and technical Anatolian high schools].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Harran Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Şanlıurfa.

Basaran, İ. E. (1982). *Örgütsel davranış [Organizational behavior].* Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Yayınları.

Bayram, L. (2006). Yönetimde yeni bir paradigma: Örgütsel bağlılık [A new paradigm in management: Organizational commitment]. *Sayıştay Dergisi [Journal of the Court of Accounts],* 123-199.

Belenkuyu, C. (2015). *Örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışının örgütsel çıktılara ve liderlik stillerine etkisi: Bir meta-analiz çalışması [The effect of organizational citizenship behavior on organizational outcomes and leadership styles: A meta-analysis study.].* Eskişehir Orhangazi Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Eskişehir.

Blakely, G.L. Andrews, M.C., & Moorman, R. H. (2005). The moderating effects of equity sensitivity on the relationship between organizational justice and organizational citizenship behaviors, *Journal of Business and Psychology*, *20* (2), 259-273.

Buluc, B., & Güneş, A.M. (2014). Relationship between organizational justice and organizational commitment in primary schools. *Anthropologist*, *18*(1), 145-152

Caglayan, E. (2014). Öğretim elemanlarının örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışları ile örgütsel adalet davranışları arasındaki ilişki [The relationship between the organizational citizenship behaviors of faculty members and organizational justice behaviors]. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi Dergisi [Journal of Educational Management in Theory and Practice]. 20*(4), 421-452.

Cihangiroglu, N., & Yılmaz, A. (2010). Çalışanların örgütsel adalet algısının örgütler için önemi [The importance of employees' perception of organizational justice for organizations]. *SÜ İİBF Sosyal ve Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi [SU FEAS Journal of Social and Economic Research],* 195-213.

Cogaltay, N., Karadag, E., & Oztekin, O. (2014). Okul müdürlerinin dönüşümcü liderlik davranışlarının öğretmenlerin örgütsel bağlılığına etkisi: Bir meta analiz çalışması [The effect of school principals' transformational leadership behaviors on teachers' organizational commitment: A meta-analysis study]. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi Dergisi [Journal of Educational Administration in Theory and Practice]. 20*(4), 483-500.

Cokuk, S. (2013). *Örgütsel adaletin örgütsel bağlılığa etkisi: Konya ilindeki özel eğitin kurumlarında bir uygulama [The effect of organizational justice on organizational commitment: An application in private education institutions in Konya].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Selçuk Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Konya.

Cremer, D.D. (2005) Procedural and distributive justice effects moderated by organizational identification, *Journal of Managerial Psychology, 20*(1): 4–13.

Cropanzano, R., & Wright, T. A. (2003). Procedural justice and organizational staffing: A tale of two paradigms. *Human Resource Management Review.* DOI:10.1016/S1053-4822(02)00097-9.

Cumming, G. (2012). *Understanding the new statistics: Effect sizes, confidence intervals, and meta-analysis (multivariate applications series).* London: Routledge.

Demir, K. (2016). Relations between teachers' organizational justice perceptions and organizational commitment and job satisfaction in the school: A meta-analysis. *International Journal of Human Sciences*, 13 (1), 1408-1417. doi: 10.14687/ ijhs. v13i1. 33961409.

Dundar, T. (2011). *Öğretmenlerin örgütse adalet algıları ile iş doyumu düzeyleri arasındaki ilişki [The relationship between teachers' perceptions of organizational justice and their job satisfaction levels].* Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.

Gok, D. (2014). *İlkokul ve ortaokullarda görevli öğretmenlerin örgütsel adalet ve örgütsel bağlılık algılarının çeşitli değişkenler açısından incelenmesi (Şahinbey/Gaziantep Örneği) [Investigation of organizational justice and organizational commitment perceptions of primary and secondary school teachers in terms of various variables (Sahinbey/Gaziantep Example)].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Gaziantep Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Gaziantep.

12

Greenberg, J. (1987). A taxonomy of rganizational Justice theories. *Academy of Management Review ,12*(1), 9-22.

Gunce, S. (2013). *İlköğretim okullarında örgütsel adalet ile örgütsel bağlılık ilişkisi [The relationship between organizational justice and organizational commitment in primary schools]*. Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Harran Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Şanlıurfa.

Gunes, A. (2019). *Öğretmenlerin Örgütsel Adalet Algıları, Örgütsel Sessizlik Düzeyleri ve Örgütsel Vatandaşlık Davranışları Arasındaki İlişki (Pendik İlçesi Örneği) [The Relationship Between Teachers' Perceptions of Organizational Justice, Organizational Silence Levels, and Organizational Citizenship Behaviors (Example of Pendik District)]*. Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Burs Uludağ Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Bursa.

Hoy, W.K., & Miskel, C.G. (2015). *Eğitim yönetimi teori, araştırma ve uygulama [Educational administration theory, research, and practice]*. Ankara: Nobel Akademik Yayıncılık,

Icerli, L. (2010). Örgütsel adalet: kuramsal bir yaklaşım [Organizational justice: a theoretical approach]*. Girişimcilik ve Kalkınma Dergisi.*

Iplik, F. N. (2015). *Örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışı [Organizational citizenship behavior].* Ankara: Akademisyen Kitabevi.

Karademir, T. (2010). Beden eğitimi öğretmenlerinin örgütsel adalet Algıları ve iş doyum düzeylerinin değerlendirilmesi [Evaluation of physical education teachers' organizational justice perceptions and job satisfaction levels]. *E-Journal of New World Science Academy*, *5*(2), 89-103.

Karaman, P. (2009). *Örgütsel adalet algısı ile tükenmişlik arasındaki ilişkinin incelenmesine yönelik öğretmenler üzerinde bir uygulama [An application on teachers to examine the relationship between organizational justice perception and burnout].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.

Kilinc, S. (2014). *Örgütsel adaletin, örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışı ve örgütsel sinizm tutumlarına etkisi (Malatya ili öğretmenleri üzerine bir uygulama) [The effect of organizational justice on organizational citizenship behavior and organizational cynicism attitudes (An application on teachers in Malatya)].* Yüksel Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Türk Hava Kurumu Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Malatya.

Kis, A. (2013). *Okul müdürlerinin öğretimsel liderlik davranışlarını gösterme düzeylerinin yönetci ve öğretmen görüşlerine yönelik bir meta-analiz [A meta-analysis of school principals' levels of displaying instructional leadership behaviors on the views of administrators and teachers].* Doktora Tezi [Ph.D. Thesis). Malatya.

Lacinoglu, Z. (2010). *İlköğretim okulu öğretmenlerinin örgütsel adalet algıları ile bazı örgütsel davranışları arasındaki ilişki [The relationship between primary school teachers' perceptions of organizational justice and some organizational behavior].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Sakarya Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Sakarya.

Moorman, R.H. (1991). Relationship between organizational justice and organizational citizenship behaviours: do fairness perceptions influence employee citizenship. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, *76*(6), 845-855.

Norsenli, F. (2020). *Öğretmenlerin örgütsel bağlılık düzeylerinin incelenmesi [Examination of teachers' organizational commitment levels]* Doktora Tezi [Ph.D. Thesis], Gazi Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, İstanbul.

Onder, E., & Ateş, Ö.T. (2017). Öğretmenlerin örgütsel adalet algısı ve örgütsel bağlılıkları arasındaki ilişkiler: Türkiye'de yapılmış çalışmaların meta-analizi [The relationships between teachers' perception of organizational justice and their organizational commitment: A meta-analysis of

13

studies conducted in Turkey]. *International Periodical for The Language and History of Turkish or Turkic*, *12*(25), 589-608.

Organ, D., & Moorman, R. (1993). Fairness and organizational citizenship behavior: what are the connections? *Social Justice Research*, *6*(1), 1-18

Ozdevecioglu, M. (2003). Örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışı ile üniversite öğrencilerinin bazı demografik özellikleri ve akademik başarıları arasındaki ilişkilerin belirlenmesine yönelik bir araştırma [A research on the relationship between organizational citizenship behavior and some demographic characteristics and academic achievements of university students]. *Erciyes Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi [Journal of Erciyes University Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences]*, *20,* 117-135.

Ozgan, H. (2011). Uygunluk açısından uygunluk, güven, tasarım açısından değerlendirme ve değerlendirme açısından karşılaştırma değerlendirmeleri [Comparison evaluations in terms of suitability, reliability, evaluation in terms of design and evaluation in terms of suitability]. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Bilimleri [Educational Sciences in Theory and Practice]*, *11*(1), 229-247.

Ozmen, Ö. N., Arbak, Y., & Özer, P. S. (2007). Adalete verilen değerin adalet algıları üzerindeki etkisinin sorgulanmasına ilişkin bir araştırma [A research on the effect of the value given to justice on perceptions of justice]. *Ege Akademik Bakış*, *7*(1), 17-33.

Oztug, Ö., Bastas, M. (2012). Öğretmenlerin örgütsel adalet konusundaki algılarının örgütsel bağlılıkları üzerindeki etkisi [The effect of teachers' perceptions on organizational justice on their organizational commitment]. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi [Journal of Hacettepe University Faculty of Education]*, *2*, 125-133.

Polat, S., & Celep, C. (2008). Ortaöğretim öğretmenlerinin örgütsel adalet, örgütsel güven, örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışlarına ilişkin algıları [Perceptions of secondary school teachers on organizational justice, organizational trust, organizational citizenship behaviors]. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi [Educational Management in Theory and Practice], 54,* 307-331.

Sahin, R., & Kavas, E. (2016). Örgütsel adalet ile örgütsel bağlılık arasındaki ilişkinin belirlenmesinde öğretmenlere yönelik bir araştırma: bayat örneği [A research on teachers in determining the relationship between organizational justice and organizational commitment: a stale example]. *Vizyoner Dergisi [Journal of Visionary], 7*(14), 199-140.

Selbi, A. (2019). *Okul müdürlerinin kullandıkları liderlik stilleri ve örgütsel adalet davranışlarının öğretmenlerin örgütsel yabancılaşmalarını yordama derecesi [The extent to which leadership styles and organizational justice behaviors used by school principals predict teachers' organizational alienation].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi M.Sc. Thesis], Mersin Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Mersin.

Seviltopu, A. (2011). *Ortaöğretim öğretmenlerinin örgütsel adalet algıları ile örgütsel bağlılıkları arasındaki ilişki [The relationship between secondary school teachers' perceptions of organizational justice and their organizational commitment].* Yüksek Lisans Tezi [M.Sc. Thesis], Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniversitesi, Burdur.

Tan, S. (2017). *Meslek liselerinde örgütsel adaletin okul-sanayi işbirliğine etkisi ve örgütsel vatandaşlığın aracı rolü: İstanbul ili örneği [The effect of organizational justice on school-industry cooperation in vocational high schools and the mediating role of organizational citizenship: The case of Istanbul]* (Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi) [Unpublished master's thesis]. Bahçeşehir Üniversitesi, İstanbul.

Titrek, O. (2009). Okul türüne göre okullardaki örgütsel adalet düzeyi [Organizational justice level in schools by school type]. *Uluslararası İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi 6*(2), 551-573.

Ugurlu, C. T. (2009). *İlköğretim okulu öğretmenlerinin örgütsel bağlılık düzeylerine yöneticilerinin etik liderlik ve örgütsel adalet davranışlarının etkisi [The effect of principals' ethical leadership and organizational justice behaviors on primary school teachers' organizational commitment levels].* Doktora Tezi [Ph.D. Thesis], İnönü Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Malatya.

Yildiz, S. (2010). Öğretmenlerin iş doyumları, örgütsel adalet algıları ve örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışları üzerine Kayseri'de bir araştırma [A study in Kayseri on teachers' job satisfaction, organizational justice perceptions and organizational citizenship behaviors]. *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi [Journal of the Social Sciences Institute], 33(2).* 239-262).